# PROTECTED AREAS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (PAAC) Meeting

# Wednesday 26 October 2016, 09h00 – 12h00 False Bay Nature Reserve HQ Multipurpose Hall

# **Attendance:**

NAME	ORGANISATION	PRESENT	APOLOGY
Richard Cammell (RC)	FoZR	Х	
(Chairperson: FBNR PAAC)	Zeekoevlei Civil Association	^	
Abdulla Parker	CCT: TCT (\$&\$)		Х
Anthony Roberts	CTEET		х
Asieff Khan (AK)	CCT: ERMD (BM)	Х	
Candice Haskins	CCT: Strategy and		
	Specialist Support		X
Carla Wood	WWF		Х
Cherilee Geduldt	CCT: ERMD (BM)		Х
Dalton Gibbs	CCT: ERMD (BM)		X
David Whitelaw (DW)	Cape Bird Club	Х	
Gail Cleaver	Cape Nature		Х
Gavin Lawson (GL)	Zandvlei Trust	Х	
Grant Mackenzie (GM)	CCT: Environmental Health	х	
Jimmy Baigrie	Zeekoevlei Yacht Club,		
	Zeekoevlei Sailing Centre &		x
	Zeekoevlei Peninsula		^
	Security		
Jo-Anne O'Shea	CCT: Solid Waste		Х
Joanne Jackson (JJ)	CCT: ERMD	Х	
Jocelyn van Eeden (JvE) (Secretary - minutes)	CTEET (intern)	х	
Helen Jordaan	CCT: Sports and Recreation		Х
Linda Ndlela	CCT: Environmental		
	Management Systems		X
Louise Matschke (LM)	CTEET	Х	
Mandy Noffke	WESSA: WC		X
Michael Farquhar	Two Oceans Aquarium /		
	Special Rating Area (SRA)		X
Mornay de Vos (MdV)	CCT: CFWWTW		Х
Na-eem Davids (ND)	CCT: TCT (S&S) (Intern)	Х	
Natanya Dreyer	CCT: ERMD (BM)		Х

Nicola Rule (NR)	CCT: ERMD (intern)	Х	
Nizaam Henry (NH)	CCT: CFWWTW	Х	
Pauline van der Spuy	CCT: Tourism		Х
Rashaad Samaai (RS)	CCT : ERMD (E&HM)	Х	
Shihabuddeen Khan (SK)	CCT: ERMD (BM)	Х	
Stephen Granger (SG)	CCT: ERMD	Х	
Xolisile Mama	CCT: Cleansing		Х

Item	Action
Welcome, attendance and apologies:	
RC welcomed all and apologised for the minutes, agenda and invitations not being sent out timeously due to corrections and administration issues. RC assured all that this would not happen again.	RC to attend to administration issues
Brief introductions of all attending, and apologies read out from those not in attendance.	
SG noted that no apologies had come from community members of areas such as Pelican Park, Pelican Heights, and Village Heights, whereas previously these communities were very involved. There was concern around losing involvement from those communities. Therefore further encouragement is needed to get those communities on board, and provide a report back.	
SG suggested that one identifies why they were not able to attend.	
RC agreed, and their poor attendance could partly be due to administration and secretarial issues.	
Apologies are noted above.	
Minutes of the previous meeting (27.07.2016) and Matters     Arising	
In absence of the formal minutes from the previous PAAC meeting, they could not be adopted, therefore, the adoption of the minutes of the PAAC meeting (27.07.2016) will be held over to the next meeting.	
3. FBNR Report Back – Quarterly Report	
a) Staffing Matters	
AK reported that there have been some significant staffing changes and challenges arising from staffing.	
<ul> <li>Tamaryn Khan, the previous Site Coordinator of the Rondevlei Reserve, has moved to Westlake Conservation Centre.</li> <li>SK who was at Zandvlei Nature Reserve, has been moved to Rondevlei to fulfil the position of Site Coordinator.</li> </ul>	
SK introduced himself providing a brief background on his previous work experience.	
RC remarked on change from job title of Reserve Manager to Site Coordinator.	
AK replied that the job title changes are due to the fact that Rondevlei is a section of FBNR. Within the City they are trying to match the job title up to other similar job functions within the City.	
AK resumed feedback.	
AK reported on the loss of their EPWP Programme.	

- They have been running the programme for the past three years in conjunction with the Green Jobs Unit at Westlake, and have been very successful in getting people in from local communities.
- In this quarter the program stopped, leading to a loss of approximately 37 staff. This has left a gap in their framework and operating capacity.
- The City is currently making plans to remedy that situation. Funding has been applied directly to the EPWP office to get some labour back on the ground, specifically for the picnic and public areas at FBNR.
- Long-term solution is to have permanent employment.

AK reported that there has been a positive, alternative replacement from Solid Waste to FBNR, Ms Shanaaz Moses.

- Ms Shanaaz Moses (SM) was unable to fulfil her capacity as a worker with Solid Waste. She is now working at FBNR fulfilling a VCO position.
- This addition has helped alleviate issues when gatehouse staff takes leave/are sick.

SG asked whether SM could use her experience in solid waste issues at FBNR. He suggested that SM could implement waste management at the gate.

- Advise visitors to take their litter away with them

AK responded, acknowledging that litter is a problem on the Eastern Shore and they maintain not to have any bins in the area. People tend to take responsibility for their litter.

- Focus is on educating people to be responsible for their waste, hence no bins.

## b) Highlights - Biodiversity

AK reported on the Karoo Scrub Robin which visited FBNR. The bird generated a lot of interest, especially amongst the birding community.

- People came from as far as Johannesburg to see the bird.
- Visitor statistics were in for approximately 1200 individuals to see the bird.
- The bird is no longer in the vicinity, however it did stay in the area longer than expected.
- The bird was not rung.

AK reported on the veld rehabilitation on the Eastern Shore of Zeekoevlei, which was led by Suretha Dorse.

- Aliens were removed, dunes shaped, and approximately 6000 locally indigenous plants were planted.
- The rehabilitation area has already increased animal activity, despite plants not completely covering the area.
- Hopes are to have enough funding in time to do the entire Eastern shoreline.

- Timing of planting was a bit wrong just too late (lack of rain), 80% of plants have survived.
- They are busy monitoring the plants and watering them individually.

AK expressed his gratitude for Suretha Dorses' efforts as she helped with resources and run the project. She operated in a capacity they are currently unable to.

AK noted that the project can be modelled in other places, and rehabilitation techniques will continually be improved.

SG commented that it is nice to see two branches working together.

#### c) Comments on Quarterly Report

AK encourages everyone to read the report as a lot of effort goes into its production.

GL congratulated AK and his team on producing a great False Bay Quarterly Report (FBQR).

Discussion ensued around who the report is sent to and the appropriateness of the format for certain readers.

SG noted the report has great content, and shows the reserve is functional and beneficial for CoCT. However, it is too big and detailed for City officials.

SG asked AK whether he would consider producing a reduced version, or a more detailed executive summary, to send out to Mayco members.

JJ recommended that it is a point that needs to be raised within Biodiversity Management. Every reserve has a quarterly report that feeds into Julia Woods' annual report. JJ suggested a quarterly highlight for all the reserves.

SG suggested a page or two of highlights and challenges that communities could distribute in their circles, which could have a knock-on effect in the communities.

JJ suggested one creating a newsletter to distribute to surrounding areas. It is important that the audience is identified and the newsletter is altered accordinaly.

DW asked if AK has time to take on creating an elaborative executive summary for Mayco / a newsletter for communities, and if one takes precedent over the other.

SG suggested that it could be the same thing – the Mayco executive summary could read like a newsletter.

AK responded that it would not take that much longer to write a comprehensive executive summary. It is just a question of the target market and coverage to ensure writing style is appropriate.

**AK** to explore options to extend accessibility of information out to various parties.

NH commented on other challenges that should be part of the FBQR.

- Public awareness of the E. coli content,
- Visible notice for awareness in areas of high snake activity,
- The condition of the existing toilets on the Eastern shore.

JJ commented on the status of the Eastern shore toilets.

- Vandalism has occurred in the toilets.
- As of 17 October a survey was done to get mechanisms of staff in place, they have budget allocation from their department and PID for paid EPWP staff members from now until April, there is a possibility this could be extended, and they have put forward motivations for permanent staff to work in the area.
- Visual presence of staff should curb vandalism, however it is after hours that people are mostly vandalising the toilets.
- Cameras are in place, and Quemic are currently helping to resolve the issue.

AK added that it is a small percentage of people vandalising the toilets. They are trying to curb the amount of time toilets are left unattended for vandalism. For night time scenarios the infrared cameras are in place, these are activated by movement which activates an alarm in the Quemic control room sending a 10 second clip. This can be replayed and Quemic can respond accordingly. This has alleviated the need for permanent security staff, allowing for them to be employed where they are needed.

JJ commented that someone was apprehended through the use of the cameras, and they received community service.

SG commented that infrastructure needs to come with a maintenance component otherwise it is considered wasteful expenditure.

#### 4. Zeekoevlei Catchment

### a) Dredging

RC asked if dredging was discussed with the new CoCT executive and whether it will be on the agenda and budgeted for.

RS responded that it was discussed. The purpose of the meeting was to get guidance from the authority (DEADP) regarding the process to follow as the current extended ROD expires in March 2017.

- What process should be followed
- The requirements needed
- How to go about the amendment application process

JJ reported that to action the ROD one would have to take on all the action points that it triggers and in order to do that, one would need to put the necessary infrastructure in place.

- An extension was discussed - one would have to have an

- application for further extension of the ROD before expiration.
- In parallel to applying for an extension they are looking at budgetary cycles
- In the consideration of the broader catchment issues it is a project that would have to be done over 3 financial years at the least.
- Grab sampling would need to be done to assess whether the situation has changed reassess the baseline.
- Good motivation is needed in light of current conditions.
- The liquid portion of dredged material needs to be considered taken into WWTW so that it is not flowing back into the vlei.

Therefore substantial infrastructure component that the EIA authorisation granted on the basis thereof – dredging needs to be planned properly, and considered in light of broader catchment issues.

RC agreed that dredging needs to be re-evaluated – the water is very clear - sampling in the beginning of the month showed e. coli counts at Zeekoevlei Yacht Club to be 1/100ml, and in front of FBNR Hall to be 3/100ml.

JJ commented that the cut off drain put in from WWTW has solved 1 of the problems, and vlei dynamics have changed.

- Need a status quo of the state of the vlei now.
- Where the problems are
- Need to determine current problems and cost benefit analysis, as catchment issues also need to be resolved – as catchment is still coming into the vlei
- Cannot let ROD for dredging lapse, which is why applications are being put forward.

JJ reported that they will be submitting soon

- It is a non-substantive amendment – only asking for time – no impact on the environment; one needs to give background and motivation for extension.

SG reported that there was a unanimous agreement from the meeting, including DEADP, that the ROD shouldn't lapse, and there is a need to look at the bigger picture.

- Catchment issues and dredging should be done in parallel.

Dredging to be kept on the agenda.

# b) Dumped Sludge, Lukannon Drive

JvE reported on the dumped sludge used to stabilise the dunes on Lukannon Drive.

A request for the following information was lodged at the relevant departments:

RS putting together the application – to lodge at DEADP before Christmas break.

- Status of site rehabilitation / remedial action taken
- Action taken to ensure it does not happen again.

JvE reported that questions have not been answered, after a series of emails and telephone calls to the relevant City departments.

JvE visited the site (25 October 2016): the sludge has not completely been removed and is still evident on the dunes. Pictures were shown.

RC commented that the PAAC would like to know what happened and an assurance it won't happen again.

JvE to follow-up

RS suggested that discussions need to be started up again - it was on the agenda but actions to be taken and what transpired is not clear.

SG commented that it has been a long time, and asked whether there had been an ecological study on the impact of dumping sludge on the dunes, and the impact of removing it.

RS replied that to his knowledge no specific study or EIA was done.

JJ asked what the extent of it was, and how much is left behind.

AK replied that when it occurred there was approximately 300m, currently about 50m left.

#### 5. Partner Organisations and City Departments

## a) CFWWTW

RC reported back on the meeting held at the CFWWTW between Michael Toll, NH and residents. Meeting was held due to smell problems arising from the CFWWTW.

- Problem of smell coming from incoming sewerage area. Contracts have been issued, and people are on site to do the repairs needed to fix the plant.
- Inlet works: 1st new screw should be in place by the end of December 2016. The other three screws are scheduled to be put in place.
- A new bio-filtering system to deodorise the collected gases: contract awarded and in place target date is March 2017.
- I setback: 1 bio filter was knocked off a truck en route from the docks.
- All leaks in pipeline are fixed.
- Odour issues coming from the inlet should be resolved by March 2017.

NH commented that the contract in place is to cover all feed channels from the inlet to the settling tanks.

RC reported that almost all settling tanks and aerobic digesters are working, as well as the second settling tanks, which have been refurbished and workina.

Sludge coming out of the digesters:

- The second part of the process, which produces methane, is not working properly; the CFWWTW is working on the problem the idea is to use the methane (instead of diesel) to run the boilers.
- Centrifuges are on site with their control systems, and they are all being put in place over a period of time. Plan date: December 2017.
- Presently all the sludge is being dumped on the emergency drying pans, however two beltpresses have been ordered: 1 on a ship due in 3-4 weeks; and 1 is being fabricated and due in December 2016.
- Beltpresses won't handle 100% of the sludge, but less will be going on to the emergency drying pans.

JJ asked if the beltpresses would remain permanently on site, or whether they are backup once the centrifuges are up and running.

NH responded that they will remain on site.

#### RC resumed feedback:

 One of the drying pans has been isolated, and is drying out for rehabilitation. In due course the other beds will also have to be rehabilitated.

RC asked whether the beds would be lined.

NH responded that they would not be lining the beds; they do not want to use them in the future. This is why they have purchased 8 beltpresses, and will only use 4. The other 4 will be on standby to prevent any sludge from going on the back dunes.

NH reported that there will be a change from the pasteurisation process to direct steam injection into the sludge, which will produce a more stable sludge.

NH commented that there is no tender out for sludge removal from the plant. He noted that Enviroserve is there, however they have to move the sludge elsewhere for Enviroserve to collect.

- On-going discussions with Enviroserve are underway to solve the issue, and help in removing the sludge from the back dunes.
- T1 and T2 have been shutdown, and dried out, which is first priority for removal.

# Discussion surrounding boundary between CFWWTW and the Protected Area:

RC asked if NH and CFWWTW know where the protected area boundary is at the plant.

NH responded that he was informed of which ponds are part of the plant, and which are part of the protected area.

RC asked NH if it is demarcated on site.

NH responded that it is not.

RC asked NH how they know whether they have / have not encroached on the protected area.

NH responded that Erica Essig from FBNR regularly visits the site to ensure they haven't encroached on the protected area.

RC asked all whether they should physically demarcate the area onsite.

DW responded that he discusses the situation with Erica Essig periodically, and there appears to be a good working relationship between the reserve and CFWWTW; and is hesitant to have a distinct boundary between protected area and CFWWTW. DW noted that further, detailed discussions should be had, before taking urgent action.

RC responded that he feels there should be a distinct line due to Ramsar status, and potential environmental implications in consideration of the new operating license and possible spread of sludge.

DW agrees the spread of sludge and dumping in back dunes has always been an issue, but because of the good relationship between birding community and sewerage works the boundary line needs further discussion.

JJ commented that there are some ponds that are not within the protected area in Ramsar so there is some latitude. There are gazetted boundary coordinates for the hard-works area, including the back dunes, which are excluded from the protected area.

RC responded that it would be useful to know where one area begins and ends.

RC asked whether a wall between two ponds was being raised so that the pond could contain more sludge.

NH replied that the wall is not being raised; the wall is being reinforced to improve vehicle access to the bigger sections of the sludge ponds. This will enable them to pump sludge using trucks.

NH reported that sand from the dunes is filling up the channel between S3 and S4 making it inaccessible. One is unable to move the sand because of legislation, and unable to fix the road on the opposite side, as there are no trucks to do the repairs.

JJ commented that WWTW and ponds is part of PA and it is about cooperative working.

RC commends NH, his team, and the work being done over the last few years at CFWWTW under difficult circumstances.

NH reported that there are plans to introduce chlorination, and is

PAAC to make a decision on what their recommendation is regarding demarcation between protected area and CFWWTW at the next meetina.

unsure how that will affect the birding.

DW and RC showed concern surrounding chlorination – affecting birding, and water quality being released into the river light of the implementation of fish ladders.

#### b) Feedback on EPWP Project at Village Heights

SG reported on the EPWP Project at Village Heights:

- Funding comes from the Greenest Metro Competition, which the CoCT won.
- Motivated five projects that would be accommodated under the funding – 2 or 3 of the projects fall within FBNR and 4 of the 5 within the South Peninsula.
- One of the projects is the development of a community nature garden at Village Heights (between the fence and the Village Heights community). This has been talked about for a number of years.
  - A co-design workshop as part of the world design capital in 2014: community members came together to design the garden.
  - o The way forward was to use the funding from the Greenest Metro and the EPWP process.
- November 2015, meeting on site with the implementing agent and Department of Environmental Affairs by January they would have the initial process finished and the approvals, and the work would start straight after that.
- A year has past; however there has been some progress.
- Action was taken Village Heights put together a tyre forest that was going to be the first element of the community nature garden.
- Recently, after a lot of petitioning the business plan has been approved and signed off.
- MOA between implementing agent and DEAR has been completed and signed.
- Hopeful to get on site before the end of the year.
- Site office and facilities need to be in place, appointing the labour (temporary jobs for people in VH and surrounding areas).
- Work would start to implement the design. Awaiting final indication that the work is going ahead.
- Once go-ahead given they will have a community meeting to brief everyone as to what will be happening.
- Idea to link it with the Biodiversity Show Case Gardens at Greenpoint.
- Vision is to create some job opportunities for young people at VH who could be trained up as tour guides and take overseas visitors from Greenpoint and its story (being linked with the 2010 Soccer World Cup), and the intention to develop a second garden within the Metro site east on the Cape Flats; and then take them to VH on a tour of the nature garden there. Economic spinoffs could be promising.
- By the time construction has commenced and plants planted it will be the start of the growing season (March / April), ready

for the rains.

- A number of other initiatives happening at VH
  - o 11th anniversary of VH (11 November 2016). They are having an event with activities, music, dancing, and drama. They are looking for prizes and some city assistance and support.
  - Event will either be Friday 11 November, or Saturday 12 November 2016.
  - o Support could be from attendance, or through providing some prizes linked with nature.

#### c) Green Jobs

AK reported that it was too late notice for Green Jobs to attend the current PAAC meeting. However, he will be present at the next meeting to discuss the issues of Mallards and Papyrus.

#### d) Recent Water Results

RC asked whether the water results are issued and available for the public.

JJ commented that water quality sampling is done at certain times and places, therefore may give a false impression of the current situation.

# e) Feedback from Site Visit to Zeekoe Catchment Hotspot Areas (20/10/2016)

RC gave a presentation on the site visit to the Zeekoe Catchment Hotspot Areas.

- Walk was led by Abdulla Parker to show why there are issues at Zeekoevlei.
- Many of the overflowing sewerage issues stem from people dumping objects into the manholes.
- The overflow then runs into the storm-water and into the canals which feed into Zeekoevlei. An entire section where manholes were overflowing in the area.
- The CoCT clears the pipes, 2 days later they are blocked again.
- A lot of litter in the area.
- Lotus River: piles of plastic bags dumped next to the river.
- Philippi farm lands Springfield low flow diversion: water entering the sluice goes to the WWTW for processing. Often needs to be unblocked as solid waste blocks the sluice gate. Overflow often occurs due to increase rain fall and solid waste blockages.
- Phumlani informal settlement: vast amount of litter in the area of which most lands up in the waterways towards Zeekoevlei.
- Nothing to stop the litter or water past this point (last line of defence is the litter fences coming into Zeekoevlei).

RC commended Abdulla Parker, and the transparency of the various departments in openly discussing problems.

- Two problems noticed during the walk:
  - Solid waste (dealing with solid waste may include proper, functioning litter traps, and make litter valuable so that it is picked up);
  - Water quality in the catchment (a far more complex issue solutions are unclear).

GL suggested the PAAC group walks more of the canals (as well as other feeder canals) at different times of year, to see it in a high flow situation.

JJ commented that FBNR is as the receiving end - one can do things at the end of the pipe, but it is the upper area that is the issue.

JJ commented that there is a Zandvlei Catchment Forum, and asked whether Zeekoevlei has one, or if the PAAC committee operates in that manner.

JJ suggested the PAAC expands their vision into the broader catchment.

JJ commented that from a solid waste point of view there is service delivery in the areas visited, and it often comes down to individual responsibilities. How much the Education Programmes reach out – how much is embraced – could be something one is able to influence.

JJ commented on getting more effective litter traps – something the PAAC should explore – there is nothing that is the perfect litter trap, and there is maintenance but maybe one could pilot one further up the catchment.

JJ commented that dealing with water quality is an issue, and suggested an Education Campaign. JJ mentioned that Environmental Health do implement Educational Campaigns, and asked GM if they have evaluated whether the Education Campaigns make an impact.

GM responded that it has been done with the EPWP workers and one of the problems within the area was grey water disposal – many RDP houses that were built in the area hadn't taken into account grey water disposal at the time.

JJ commented on taps and washing areas that are not bunded in Phumlani.

SG suggested the need for a multidisciplinary approach to solve catchment issues – engineers can advise on litter traps, weirs and diversion flow; and the social sciences to work with the communities to turnaround the systemic problem with people putting inappropriate objects in the sewerage system.

RC commented that there is no Zeekoevlei Catchment Forum.

ND reported that during the last financial year R600 000 was spent on awareness campaigns in the Gugulethu area. In terms of their

JJ to follow up on details and outcome of the campaign. monitoring plan the awareness campaign did not really yield any positive results.

JJ asked whether it has been interrogative as to why the awareness campaign hasn't worked.

ND responded that hotspot areas were identified in terms of sewer overflow, and attitudes of people living in and around the areas have not changed after the campaign, and is unsure why.

JJ commented on what message is being put out – she asked whether the message is "don't do it because its impacting our sewers" or if it is "don't do it because your child is going to get sick" – which are two different messages.

GM reported that Phumlani has 3 containers that people collect all their rubbish in, however there are about 4 other illegal dumping sites, which the CoCT cleans. He reported that the next day there is rubbish in those spots again as people know that if they dump there it is going to be collected within a week/two maximum. He reported that Solid Waste puts in place structures, with x amount of workers on the informal settlement – they collect all the bags and put it in the containers, but it isn't working as people have their own sites where they dump.

SG responded that there is not enough incentive for people to do the right thing and one needs to find what the incentive is – whether it is a negative incentive or a positive incentive. If people have the incentive they'll do it, if not, they wont. SG reported on the need to unpack why the awareness campaigns are not working – there is a need to get social sciences involved to investigate and turn it around, otherwise one will continue to not get into the right push/pull factors.

#### f) Protected Areas Advisory Committee Chair Meeting

RC attended the PAAC meeting for all Chairs and some reserve managers, and reported that there are shared problems between the PAAC's, one of them being administration/management, and a need for interns.

RC will provide comprehensive feedback at the next meeting.

#### 6. General

SG reported that the City is hosting undergraduate interns from the Boston University for six months. They are of a high quality and will work from January – June. Many have a Biological Sciences background and they could be utilised at FBNR. The partnership is with the City, so if CTEET or FoZR wanted an intern it may be a bit more difficult.

AK showed interest in the intern partnership.

#### 7. Closure and Dates of Following three Meetings

Preliminary dates for the next three PAAC Meetings:

**RC** to place on agenda.

**SG** to forward the list of potential interns to **AK**.

- 1 February 2017
- 19 April 2017
- 26 July 2017

## Acronyms commonly used:

CFWWTW: Cape Flats Wastewater Treatment Works

CoCT: City of Cape Town

CTEET: Cape Town Environmental Education Trust

ERMD: Environmental Resource Management Department (CCT)

ERMD (BM): ERM Department (Biodiversity Management Branch)

FBNR: False Bay Nature Reserve

FBNRQR: False Bay Nature Reserve Quarterly Report

FoZR: Friends of Zeekoevlei and Rondevlei
PAAC: Protected Areas Advisory Committee

SBA: Strandfontein Birding Area

TCT (S&S): Transport for Cape Town (Stormwater and Sustainability branch)

VH: Village Heights